MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COMMITTEE ON .. OFFICIAL LANGUAGE

MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI KAMAL MORARKA): On behalf of (SHRI SUBODH KANT SAHAY: I move the following Motion:—

"That in pursuance of sub-section (2) of section 4 of the Official Languages Act, 1963 (19 of 1963), this House do proceed to elect, in accordance with the system of proportional representation by means of the single transferable vote, a member from among the members of the House to be the member of the Committee on Official Language in the vacancy caused by the resignation of Shri Subramanian Swamy from the membership of the said Committee."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): Has Mr. Subramanian Swamy resigned from Government?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Has he not yet resigned from the Cabinet?

MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE CENTRAL COMMITTEE OF THE TUBERCULOSIS ASSOCIATION OF INDIA

MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI KAMAL MORARKA): On behalf of (SHRI SHAKEELUR REHMAN) I move the following Motion:--

"That in pursuance o fclause 3 (vii) (b) of the Rules and Regulations of the Tuberculosis Association of India, this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct, one member from among the members of the House to be a member of the Central Committe of the Tuberculosis Association of India."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

MESSAGE FROM THE LOK SABHA

The Assam Appropriation Bill 1991

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Madam, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Assam Appropriation Bill, 1991, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 10th January, 1991.

2. The Speaker has certified that this Bill is a Money Bill."

Madam, I lay a copy of the Bill on the Table.

REFERENCE TO THE PRIME MINISTER REMARKS ON SITUATION IN TAMIL NADU

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Murasoli Maran. (*Inetrruptions*) Chairman has given permission to Mr. Murasoli Maran to be the first speaker on a matter.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): I am on another issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On the other issue, I will allow you.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): On this issue, I may be allowed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know what issue he is raising. Perhaps, you know.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I may be permitted to speak afterwards.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just now, you please sit down.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): After he finishes, please allow me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. Fist let him finish. He has not yet even started.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam Deputy Chairman, today's newspapers carried the statement of the Prime Minister hurling charges, insinuations, allegations and falsehoods against the Government of Tamil Nadu and the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, this is objctionable.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: This should not be allowed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. It will not go on record. (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Gopalsamy, please sit down. Mr. Maran, the Chairman has permitted you to air your grievances against the statement of the Prime Minister. But I would very humbly request you to use proper words and your concern can be expressed in very proper words, without using the words which are unparliamentary. That is my request.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: I will amend my statement ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMATHAPPA: I am on point of order. Madam, the Prime Minister is... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am allowing his point of order. It is now for the Chair to decide whether the point of order being raised is in order or out of order. Let me first hear him and if I feel that it is not in order, you know, I will tell him that it is not in order unless you yourself want to handle it. And now whatever Mr. Maran says would not be heard properly and if you want him to be heard properly, I would request you humbly to please allow him to speak; otherwise if there is so much of noise, he may not be heard properly.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Madam, my point of order is regarding the statement by the Prime Minster. He is the head of the Government and is responsible to this House also. If he could make a statement here, we can have the opportunity to get clarifications, instead of allowing the Member to speak. You may kindly ask the Prime Minister to make a statement here... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order arising out of it. Now, the Chairman has permitted Mr. Maran to speak. Now let him finish.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam, the allegations made by the Prime Minister are totally baseless; they are a canard to malign the people. He has made serious allegations against the State Government. He says there are six ULFA camps in Tamil Nadu. I challenge the Prime Minister It is a hoax on the people. First he brought in LTTE to topple the Government. They wanted to play this game; but nobody could believe them. Now they are bringing in ULFA... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You may not make a speech on it while showing your disapproval of it.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: And he has accused the State Government. This is the Council of States;

we all represent State Governments. Can we consider ourselves living in a federal polity? Is the relationship between the Centre and the State that of a master and a servant? Some people here think that master-slave relationship should continue. It cannot be; it will not be. Madam, he has made very serious allegations saying that information passed on to the Chief Minister has been leaked out to LTTE in Madras and in Jaffna. It is a very serious allegation. It implies that the Chief Minister behaveed against the oath he has taken in the name of the Constitution. I don't know how Mr. Chandra Shekhar found it out. He is the *champion against phone-tapping.* Probably now he has tapped the phones. How did he find out? The House should know about it as to how did he know? How could he make this serious allegation... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: He also said that he has the evidence; you didn't here... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Yes, you have done it... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Mr. Morarka is there to answer. (*Interruptions*) Please take your seats (*Interruptions*) Mr. Morarka is going to react to it. I will give him time. Now, Mr. Maran. I would request you. Please make a brief statement. Don't say such things where ou lose your cause. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: The Prime Minister is under severe pressure. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Gujarat): I think the hon. Member was saying that he was the champion against phone-tapping. I think this is what he was saying.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: I said, Mr. Chandra Shekhar was the champion against phone-tapping. (*Interruptions*) Is it wrong?

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): Madam, may I make a submission? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Morarka will answer. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: We all know that the hon. Prime Minister is under severe pressure from his masters, the Congress (I) Party. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Maran, it was denied by the Prime Minister. (*Interruptions*) He is giving a dying declaration before the House. (*Interruptions*) The Prime Minister has made it clear that he is not under pressure from the Congress (I).

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): You have already destroyed Tamil Nadu. It is enough Please leave Tamil Nadu. I beg of you. You have destroyed the culture of Tamil Nadu. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think there is no point in getting agitated in such a manner. I would again request Mr. Maran. Please make a brief statement so that Mr. Morarka can respond to it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam Deputy Chairman, after making these total baseless allegations, after throwing all these cantards, the Prime Minister concludes 'Yet I will not dismiss the Government.' This is a typical example of double thinking and double talk. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't interrupt him. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*) I will send you out of the House if you do it. I again remind hon. Members that the Chairman has permitted Mr. Maran to

make a statement. Please do not interrupt and make the House look like a bazar. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Abrar Ahmed, I warn you, Please behave properly. Don't do all these things. Don't teach me. Sitting in the Chair, I can see what is going on. Don't instigate anybody. Let this matter be over. (*Interruptions*) Let the matter be over. Let the Govern- react to it. You are not yet the Gov ernment. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: It is very clear that the back-seat drivers of this Government are turning the steering wheel handled by Mr. Chandra Shekhar in the wrong direction. (*Interruptions*)

MINISTER OF PETROLEUM AND CHEMICALS AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA): I deny this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is denying it (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: The back-seat drivers are the Congress (I) and the A.I.A.D.M.K. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On behalf of the Government, Mr. Morarka will reply (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He is accusing the Congress Party.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You also repudiate it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We should also be given an opportunity.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman gave the permission, I did not give the permission. (*Interruptions*). All right, I will allow.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: I will amend my statement. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I promise, Mrs. Alva, I will allow you to say whatever you want to say, but let him finish at least. If in between you do it, he will never be able to finish, and it will go on the whole day.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam, looking to the manner in which the hon. Members are expressing their feelings, I would put it in a different way. I would say, the pressure is not as much from the All India Congress but from the Tamil Nadu Congress. (*Interruptions*). There is no such party as Congress in Tamil Nadu. It is a wonderful situation. They have no legs to stand upon. There they have to walk with the stick of others. They want to ride on somebody else's shoulders. They do not have legs. That is why they are shamelessly applying pressure on the Prime Minister.

Madam, the allegations are very severe, very strong. According to me, they are totally baseless. I do not know how a disciple of Jayaprakash Narayan and Acharya Narendra Dev fell a prey to such a falsehood. Never before in the history of India such an allegation has been made against any State Government or the Chief Minister on the floor of the House. Therefore, we request that the House. Therefore, we request that come to this House and clarify the position.

SHRE V. GOPALSAMY: Let the Prime Minister come and make a statement. He should come and apologise. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Go back. I say, go back. (*Interruptions*). Let me be heard. I won't allow. Please keep quiet. (*Interruptions*). Please go back. Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. (*Interruptions*) It is very unfortunate, Mr. Maran, that when permission was given to you by the Chairman, it was decided that you will make a statement and such things will not happen in the House, there would be no *halla-gulla*

[The Deputy Chairman]
and nobody would speak like that. ... (*Interruptions*)... They did not come first. I did not allow them to speak, no. ... (*Interruptions*)... I did not allow. Nobody came. Please sit down. ... (*Interruptions*)... Mrs. Natarajan, will you please let me speak? ... (*Interruptions*)... I said, please sit down. ... (*Interruptions*)... I will hear you later, but just now you sit down. That is not fair. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He called*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam, it appears one of the Members has called a very bad name. ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him speak first. Then I will hear you.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Their allegation is that one of the Members has made a very serious allegation about the Members here in Tamil. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He called.*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam, if any bad, unparliamentary, word has been used... ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I would appeal to the leader of the DMK to withdraw that word. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam, I did not hear that word. ... (*Interruptions*) I have got great respect for Mr. Shiv Shanker. I have not heard that Tamil word. ... (*Interruptions*)...If any unparliamentary word has been used, Madam, I request you to expunge it—and I apologize for it. ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please, the matter is over. If it is a serious matter, I think, instead of making such kind of an expression of coming to the well of the House, it is much nicer that the Government react to it. I don't understand the Tamil language and so, I don't know what has been said. But Mr. Maran has apologized on behalf of anybody if he had said it. ... (*Interruptions*)... Please let me finish.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam, I have not heard it. If any such word has been used, I apologize.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Maran, I am saying the same thing. The whole trouble is, you don't allow anybody to speak.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Sorry, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said, "If anybody said it." And that is what Mr. Maran has said. If anybody has said any word which is hurting anyone or is abusive, he has apologized. Now, please, I request every one to behave in a more dignified manner ... (*Interruptions*)... I apologize on behalf of everybody, all right?

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: You need not, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I apologize for any misconduct in this House, okay? Now let us have peace in the House and let the matter go in a peaceful manner. Now, please take your seats.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, just now it has been stated that Mr. Maran apologized for any statement made by Mr. Balu. ... (*Interruptions*) ...Our point is, the Prime Minister should come and apologize for what he said about Tamil Nadu... ... (*Interruptions*)...He should come and apologize. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam,

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, may I....

... (*Interruptions*)...

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you sit down I might allow you, but if you keep on interrupting I will not allow. ... (*Interruptions*). I will ask that gentleman also to sit down. If anybody speaks without my permission, I am not going to permit anybody. I think nobody is interested either in getting an answer because it seems everybody is trying to score a point over everybody else. ... (*Interruptions*) ... I say, please keep quiet. I asked the Minister, from the Government. He will tell you if the Prime Minister is coming or not or when. If you don't allow him to speak, how can I tell you whether the Prime Minister will come or not? I don't know. So, please let him speak.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: You wanted to hear us also. It is not they alone. We have also got to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Natarajan, just a minute. Let this matter be over. I will allow you. I will permit one person. But please ask him to sit down. Otherwise I won't permit. I am telling you, I won't permit if such a commentary goes on in the House. I won't permit from this side also if people do not keep quiet. I am giving this warning, I won't permit anybody to speak if people do not sit in peace and listen. Please take your seat. I say, please take your seat. I will allow Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan or Mr. Narayanasamy to say whatever they want to say. Whatever they want to say, I will allow. (*Interruptions*)

Just a minute. Let her finish. Let Mrs. Jayanthi say what she wants to say on the same issue, and then we will ask the Government what it wants to say. But not everybody, I assure you, not everybody. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, just a minute.

(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order. I will allow you. But let it be peaceful. If anybody is hurt, I think, he should express his hurt in a proper manner so that it is felt that he is hurt.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam, I am not only peaceful, but I am ensuring peace.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Very good. I am so happy. Thank you, Mr. Dipen Ghosh.

DR. NAGEN SAIKIA (Assam): Madam, I wish to make a point on this issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Madam, I want to make a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Let her say something on this, what has happened just now. I will allow Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan to speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, coming from the State of Tamil Nadu, we are all in a state of panic because the law and order has completely broken down in the State of Tamil Nadu.

SHRI T. R. BALU (Tamil Nadu): *Aiyo, aiyo.*

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: What does "*aiyo*" mean? What is the meaning of "*aiyo*" Ask him.*

(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. I myself do not know the meaning of "*aiyo*". Please let her speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, they are not allowing her to speak.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, the culture of the Government in Tamil Nadu was exhibited around the same time when they came to power to years ago. ... (*Interruptions*)

*Expunged as ordered 1st by the Chair.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, on a point of order.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, from that day till today the lives of the people in Tamil Nadu, especially women, are not safe in the State.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Are we discussing the conduct of the State Government or the statement of the Prime Minister? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: A point of order, Madam. It was agreed in the Chairman's room ... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed the point of order. Let me be heard.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, it was agreed in the Chairman's room that Mr. Maran would make a statement, would demand a statement from the Prime Minister, a clarification from the Prime Minister, and the Government would respond.

You have called Mr. Kamal Morarka to respond. If you allow the other Member, then, you will have to allow all the party leaders. That will become a debate. (*Interruptions*) Let Mr. Morarka say that. When the Prime Minister comes we can express our views. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. I have to answer the point of order.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: The people of Tamil Nadu are in panic. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am trying to make him sit down. (*Interruptions*) वाजपेयी जी आपकी आवाज तो सुनाई नहीं देती । (व्यवधान)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : आप इधर देखिये, उधर क्यों देख रही हैं । (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Natarajan, now that Mr. S. K. T. Ramachandran has spoken on your behalf, everything is over. अटल जी बोलिए । (*Interruptions*) This is not the way. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: Unless the Tamil Nadu Government is dismissed, I will sit here in *Dharna*. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Who are you to decide the fate of our people? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned for fifteen minutes.

The House then adjourned for fifteen minutes at thirty-one minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at fifty minutes past eleven of the clock.

The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

..REFERENCE ..TO THE PRIME MINISTER'S REMARKS ON SITUATION IN TAMIL NADU—Contd. ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just now it is Mr. Malaviya's turn.

पेट्रोलियम और रसायन मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्री (श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय) : उपसभापति जी, सुबह जैसा कि नेताओं की बैठक में सभापति जी के समक्ष तय हुआ था, मैंने श्री मारन की बात को सुन लिया है और जो भी समय आप तय करेंगी उस समय प्रधान मंत्री जी सदन में आ करके अपनी बात को रख देंगे ।

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, I want to submit on this....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, you cannot submit on this.... (*Interruptions*)...